

# WEST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

**Wednesday 13 July 2011**

**COUNCILLORS PRESENT:** Councillors Van Nooijen (Chair), Goddard (Vice-Chair), Benjamin, Cook, Gotch, Jones, Khan, Price and Tanner.

**OFFICERS PRESENT:** Alec Dubberley (Democratic Services Officer), Murray Hancock (City Development), Michael Crofton-Briggs (Head of City Development) and Steven Roberts (City Development)

## **15. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND SUBSTITUTIONS**

None

## **16. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Colin Cook, Personal, A former student of Queen's College.

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen, Personal, A former neighbouring resident and member of Queen's College.

4. 123 - 127 Walton Street and 32 - 32a Little Clarendon Street, Oxford - 11/00711/FUL and 11/01478/FUL.

Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen, Personal, A former employee of University College.

## **17. ST CLEMENT'S CAR PARK AND PUBLIC CONVENIENCE, ST CLEMENT'S STREET, OXFORD - 11/01044/CAC**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing an application for the demolition of public toilets, redevelopment of St. Clement's car park to provide student accommodation (141 bedrooms) and ancillary facilities over 3 blocks. The report also proposed a replacement car park (74 spaces), public toilets, landscaping and ancillary works.

Councillor Van Nooijen explained that there had been a number of requests to defer consideration of the application to allow a further period of consultation. The Committee discussed the merits of a deferral following advice from Planning Officers.

Resolved to defer consideration of the application for the following reasons:-

- 1) To allow a further period of consultation on the amendments to the plans for the scheme so that all comments from the public can be considered; and
- 2) To allow officers time to provide further details on the replacement car park that would be required during the construction phase of the project.

**18. 123 - 127 WALTON STREET AND 32 - 32A LITTLE CLARENDON STREET, OXFORD - 11/00711/FUL AND 11/01478/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing to planning applications as follows:-

(i) 11/00711/FUL: Retention of front part of 123-125 and 127 Walton Street. Erection of new structure. Demolition of 126 Walton Street and 32-32A Little Clarendon Street and their replacement with new 3 and 4 storey building. Provision of 6 retail units on ground and basement floors with student accommodation (41 Study rooms) on upper floors (amended plans)

(ii) 11/01478/FUL: Demolition of 126 Walton Street and 32/32a Little Clarendon Street.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Huw Mellor, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the development.

Resolved to support the applications in principle, but defer the applications in order to receive a unilateral undertaking with the City and County Councils to secure appropriate developer contributions, and on receipt of the agreement delegate to officers the issuing of the notices of planning permission and conservation area consent subject to the following conditions:-

(i): 11/00711/FUL:

1. Development begun within time limit
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans
3. Samples of materials
4. Landscape plan required including details of all hard/soft landscaping and SUDs.
5. Landscaping carried out by completion
6. Landscaping specified for retention
7. Landscape management plan and Tree Protection Measures
8. Car and Cycle parking provision before use
9. Cycle parking details required; Sheffield stands required
10. Construction no mud on highway
11. Foul and surface water drainage system
12. Surface water drainage criteria
13. Layout design and installation of utility services
14. Energy Efficiency/renewable energy measures
15. Restriction on student use
16. Student management plan
17. Details of gates and boundary treatment.
18. Land and water contamination
19. Car parking spaces details of how marked out.

20. Students - No cars
21. Construction Traffic Management Plan
22. Management statement and plan regarding waste storage
23. Exclusion from eligibility for parking permits.
24. Security measures-lighting and CCTV in courtyard
25. Archaeological investigation -watching brief during groundworks
26. Recording all buildings
27. Recording and conservation and retention of the historic advertisement panels in situ on the corner of 127 Walton Street
28. Further details on the following matters:
  - a) methodology and specification for the stabilisation/repair and protection of the building fabric to be retained,
  - b) the extent of demolition proposed,
  - c) construction details, including shop fronts, windows, eaves, verges and abutments.
29. Details of proposed mechanical plant
30. Restricted deliveries to commercial premises
31. Retention of existing post box.

(ii): 11/00713/CAC

1. Development begun within time limit
2. Recording of 126 Walton Street and 32/32a Little Clarendon Street
3. No demolition without contract for redevelopment

**19. REAR OF 17 - 41 MILL STREET, OXFORD - 11/00927/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing an application for the erection of a 3 storey building to accommodate 74 student rooms plus warden's accommodation as well as the provision of cycle and bin storage facilities and landscaping.

The Planning Case Officer advised of one late comment received from the local Member of Parliament highlighting concerns about certain aspects of the scheme. He said that the objections raised did not highlight any new issues and the recommendation to approve the application stood.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Amanda Whiting, a neighbouring resident, spoke in objection to the application and Nick Lyzba, the applicant's agent, spoke in support.

Resolved to support the development in principle but defer the application in order to complete an accompanying legal agreement and delegate Officers the issuing of planning permission subject to the following conditions:-

- 1 Development begun within time limit
- 2 Develop in accordance with approved plans
- 3 Amended drawings
- 4 Samples
- 5 On site management of students
- 6 Occupancy restrictions
- 7 Student accommodation: out of term use
- 8 Tree protection plan

- 9 No felling, lopping, cutting
- 10 Landscape: underground services
- 11 Tree protection plan
- 12 Arboricultural method statement
- 13 Landscape plan required
- 14 Landscape carry out after completion
- 15 Landscape management plan
- 16 Students no cars
- 17 No car parking on site
- 18 Control of access
- 19 Restrict delivery / service times
- 20 Cycle parking
- 21 Bin stores: amended drawings
- 22 Scheme of lighting and CCTV
- 23 Boundary treatment
- 24 Ground contamination
- 25 Vibration: details to protect development
- 26 Noise from development
- 27 Soundproofing of development from railway noise
- 28 Development in accordance with Flood Risk Assessment (FRA)
- 29 Sustainable drainage
- 30 NRIA
- 31 Construction management plan
- 32 Travel plan
- 33 Archaeology
- 34 Public art
- 35 Further habitat survey
- 36 Wildlife habitats
- 37 Fire hydrants

The Committee also required details of the landscaping scheme (conditions 13 and 15 refer) be brought to a future Committee meeting for approval, and that in the event that there is additional demand for cycle parking then it should be provided accordingly.

**20. HERNES HOUSE RESIDENTIAL HOME, 3 HERNES CRESCENT, OXFORD - 10/02605/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a planning application for the demolition of Hernes House and erection of 9 dwellings (5 x 4-bedroom and 4 x 5-bedroom) as well as the provision of 18 car parking spaces, private amenity space and landscaping.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, Steven Sensecall, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the development.

Resolved to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:-

- 1) The proposed development was of an inappropriately low density for a brownfield site of this size;
- 2) The absence of an acceptable scheme of affordable housing; and

- 3) Non compliance with balance of dwellings policies.

## **21. 376 BANBURY ROAD, OXFORD - 10/00755/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing an application for the demolition of an existing building, erection of a 5 storey building providing 3 x 3 bedroom and 6 x 2 bedroom flats, with 18 car parking spaces, cycle parking and bin store at basement level accessed from Hernes Road.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking the Nick Caldwell and Peter Uzzell, on behalf of the applicants, spoke in support of the development.

Resolved to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:-

- 1) Having regard to its height, scale, mass and overall appearance, the proposal would constitute an overlarge, over dominant and incongruous development in relation to neighbouring residential properties which fails to strengthen, enhance and protect the distinctive suburban residential character of the locality, contrary to policies CP.1, CP.8 and CP.9 of the adopted Oxford Local Plan 2001 to 2016 and policy CS.18 of the adopted Oxford Core Strategy 2026;
- 2) In the absence of any fully detailed justification for the non - provision of affordable accommodation for people in priority need, the development fails to meet the requirements of policy HS.4 of the adopted Oxford Local Plan 2001 to 2016 and policy CS.24 of the adopted Oxford Core Strategy 2026 which seek to address the need for appropriate accommodation for the homeless, the unemployed and those on modest incomes unable to afford market housing;
- 3) With a provision of 2 x 3 bed and 6 x 2 bed flats the proposed development fails to meet the requirements of policy CS.23 of the adopted Oxford Core Strategy 2026 which seeks to provide an appropriate balance of dwelling types in response to the declining proportion of housing suitable for family occupation available within the local housing stock, and the delivery of mixed communities; and
- 4) The proposed large balcony areas to upper floor flats would give rise to a loss of privacy by reason of overlooking of private gardens serving the adjacent residential development at 378 Banbury Road, contrary to policy HS.19 of the adopted Oxford Local Plan 2001 to 2026.

## **22. OXONIAN REWLEY PRESS LTD, LAMARSH ROAD, OXFORD - 11/01214/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a planning application for the demolition of the existing

Oxonian Rewley Press premises as well as the erection of 8 flats (2x1, 4x2 and 2x3 bed) in a three storey block with 10 car parking spaces, cycle and bin storage.

The Planning Case officer advised that the Environment Agency had submitted late comments highlighting no objections to the scheme.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Huw Mellor, on behalf of the applicant, spoke in support of the development. He confirmed that the developer was prepared to contribute £20,000 towards flood mitigation.

Resolved to defer consideration of the application pending the submission of further details relating to the viability of affordable housing provision either on the site or at an off-site location.

### **23. 7 NORHAM GARDENS, OXFORD - 11/01307/FUL AND 11/01308 LBC**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing two applications for the following:-

i) 11/01307/FUL – Change of use from educational use to single dwelling. As well as the erection of a two storey side extension and garden studio involving removal of existing classroom building.

ii) 11/01308/LBC – Demolition of existing conservatory, toilet block and garage as well as the erection of a two-storey extension, internal alterations including new openings, removal of existing partitions, new staircase and new partitions.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Nick Lyzba, on behalf of the applicant, spoke in support of the development.

Resolved to grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:-

#### 10/03409/LBD

- 1 Commencement of works LB/CAC consent
- 2 LB/CAC consent - approved plans
- 3 7 days notice to LPA
- 4 LB notice of completion
- 5 Further works - fabric of LB - fire regs
- 6 Repair of damage after works
- 7 Materials - samples
- 8 Internal features – partitions, openings, staircase, doors, fireplaces, cornices etc
- 9 Further Details floors, windows, staircases, new internal doors etc
- 10 Archaeological building recording
- 11 Extraction/fumes
- 12 External lighting
- 13 Boundary treatment
- 14 Retain historic doors
- 15 Retain historic fireplaces
- 16 Amended plans - dormer window on north-west elevation
- 17 Walls/openings to match adjoining

#### 10/03407/FUL

- 1 Development begun within time limit
- 2 Develop in accordance with approved plans
- 3 Samples in Conservation Area
- 4 Archaeological recording
- 5 Boundary details
- 6 Amenity – no additional side windows
- 7 Provision of cycle parking and bin stores prior to first occupation
- 8 Gates not to open over the highway
- 9 Restricted boundary treatments either side of access points
- 10 Conservation rooflight in side elevation to be 1.6 metres above ffl
- 11 Use of garden pavilion to be ancillary to enjoyment of main house
- 12 Drainage to be SUDS compliant
- 13 Variation of Road Traffic Order – Norham Gardens
- 14 Porous materials for new driveway areas
- 15 Side window to be obscure glazed with restricted openers and so retained
- 16 No felling, lopping, cutting
- 17 Details of refurbished gates
- 18 Detailed landscape plan including a planting plan and schedule
- 19 Trees - Underground services and drainage soakaways
- 20 Detailed Tree Protection Plan
- 21 Design and construction details for doors and windows
22. Cycle parking – secure and covered
- 23 Amended plans - dormer window on north-west elevation

#### **24. 92 GLOUCESTER GREEN, OXFORD - 11/01135/FUL**

*The Committee considered items 10, 11 and 12 together as the applications were for an identical change of use in the same area.*

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Sally Thomas, a neighbouring resident, spoke in objection to the development and Nick Lyzba (on behalf of the applicant) spoke in support.

Resolved to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:-

- 1) The change of use would result in an unacceptable balance between food and retail outlets in the Gloucester Green area.
- 2) The change of use would result in an unacceptable loss of amenity for neighbouring residents due to the potential for noise and disturbance, and for cooking smells from the proposed restaurants; and
- 3) The waste disposal/collection and ventilation arrangements to the units were not considered adequate.

#### **25. 98 GLOUCESTER GREEN, OXFORD - 11/01140/FUL**

*The Committee considered items 10, 11 and 12 together as the applications were for an identical change of use in the same area.*

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Sally Thomas, a neighbouring resident, spoke in objection to the development and Nick Lyzba (on behalf of the applicant) spoke in support.

Resolved to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:-

- 4) The change of use would result in an unacceptable balance between food and retail outlets in the Gloucester Green area.
- 5) The change of use would result in an unacceptable loss of amenity for neighbouring residents due to the potential for noise and disturbance, and for cooking smells from the proposed restaurants; and
- 6) The waste disposal/collection and ventilation arrangements to the units were not considered adequate.

## **26. 99 GLOUCESTER GREEN, OXFORD - 11/01142/FUL**

*The Committee considered items 10, 11 and 12 together as the applications were for an identical change of use in the same area.*

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Sally Thomas, a neighbouring resident, spoke in objection to the development and Nick Lyzba (on behalf of the applicant) spoke in support.

Resolved to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:-

- 7) The change of use would result in an unacceptable balance between food and retail outlets in the Gloucester Green area.
- 8) The change of use would result in an unacceptable loss of amenity for neighbouring residents due to the potential for noise disturbance, and for cooking smells from the proposed restaurants; and
- 9) The waste disposal/collection and ventilation arrangements to the units were not considered adequate.

## **27. FORTHCOMING PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

Members noted the following planning applications would be before the Committee at future meetings:-

- 1) 190 Iffley Rd: 11/00268/FUL: Office in garden (call in)
- 2) Meadow Lane: 11/01473/FUL: Skateboard Park
- 3) Grove Street, Summertown: 11/01165/FUL: 4 houses & 3 flats



- 4) Travis Perkins site, Chapel St: 11/01712/RES: Graduate student accommodation
- 5) St. Hugh's College: Chinese Institute and student accommodation.
- 6) University Science Area: 11/00940/CONSLT: Science Area Masterplan
- 7) 65 Donnington Bridge Road: 11/01532/FUL: Extension and conversion to 2 flats.
- 8) 3 Bladon Close - 11/01398/FUL

The Planning Officer indicated that not all the planning applications listed would be reported to the August meeting of committee but would come to future meetings. Others would now be dealt with under Officers' delegated powers following the withdrawal of call in to committee.

## **28. PLANNING APPEALS**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) giving details of planning appeals received and determined during May 2011.

Resolved to note the report.

## **29. MINUTES**

Resolved to approve, as a correct record, the minutes of the meeting held on 8 June 2011.

**The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 8.48 pm**